

AGENDA

CITY OF MONONA
BOARD OF REVIEW
CITY HALL LARGE CONFERENCE ROOM
CITY HALL – 5211 SCHLUTER ROAD
TUESDAY, MAY 17, 2016
6:00 P.M.

- A. Call To Order
- B. Roll Call
- C. Approval of Minutes of June 2, 2015
- D. Appointment of the Chairperson of the Board of Review
- E. Acknowledgement that the mandatory training requirements specified in §70.46(4), Wisconsin Statutes have been met (Members James Hoelzel and Robert Larsen through May 9, 2018)
- F. Assessor's Report
 - Approximate percentage of assessment change: Preliminary result is an overall increase of 4.80% (Residential 5.47%, Commercial 3.43%)
 - Assessment notices to all property owners: April 13, 2016
 - Assessment Roll available in City Hall: approximately April 15, 2016
 - Open Book: April 28 and 29, 2016
- G. Adjournment to 6:00 p.m. Thursday, June 2, 2016 at the Library Municipal Room

NOTE: Upon reasonable notice, the City of Monona will accommodate the needs of disabled individuals through auxiliary aids or services. For additional information or to request this service, contact Joan Andrusz at (608) 222-2525 (not a TDD telephone number, Fax: (608) 222-9225, or through the City Police Department TDD telephone number 441-0399.

The public is notified that any final action taken at a previous meeting may be reconsidered pursuant to the City of Monona ordinances. A suspension of the rules may allow for final action to be taken on an item of New Business.

It is possible that members of and a possible quorum of members of other governmental bodies of the municipality may be in attendance at the above stated meeting to gather information or speak about a subject, over which they have decision-making responsibility. Any governmental body at the above stated meeting will take no action other than the governmental body specifically referred to above in this notice.

JA

BOARD OF REVIEW MINUTES

June 2, 2015

The regular meeting of the Board of Review for the City of Monona was called to order by Chairman Larsen at 6:01 p.m.

Present: Chairman Robert Larsen, Richard Mastenbrook, Pat Chermak, James Hoelzel, Scott Warner, Judy Lynn, and Kellie Unke

Also Present: City Assessor Jim Danielson of Accurate Appraisal and City Clerk Joan Andrusz

Chairman Larsen confirmed there was a quorum for tonight's hearing and excused 1st Alternate Lynn and 2nd Alternate Unke from attendance.

City Clerk Andrusz distributed revised agendas and packet materials for the two cases now on the agenda. The case of Steve & Kelly Rush, 4655 Tonyawatha Trail, Parcel No. 0710-172-6124-7 on the previous agenda version was withdrawn.

City Assessor Danielson swore his Oath of Office as administered by City Clerk Andrusz.

ACCEPTANCE OF ASSESSMENT ROLL

City Assessor Danielson signed the Assessor's Affidavit and the 2015 Assessment Roll was received by City Clerk Andrusz.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion by Ms. Chermak, seconded by Mr. Mastenbrook, to approve the minutes of May 19, 2015, was carried.

Chairman Larsen asked if there was anyone present who was not on the agenda. Jeannie Kowing stated she misread the deadlines for filing an objection. Chairman Larsen stated it is up to the Board to determine if good cause was shown to allow a late-filed hearing. Because there were only two cases for tonight's hearing the Board agreed to hear Ms. Kowing's case after the scheduled hearings. City Clerk Andrusz distributed Ms. Kowing's hearing exhibit materials.

Chairman Larsen outlined the order of proceedings for those present throughout the hearings as follows: the Objector states their case, followed by the Assessor's response. The Objector may respond and ask questions of the Assessor and the Assessor may question the Objector. Members ask questions of all those who testify. Deliberations and the Board decision follows. The Assessor's value is presumed to be correct; it is up to the Objector to prove the assessment is incorrect.

APPEARANCES BEFORE THE BOARD OF REVIEW

Charles Paskey appeared and was sworn in along with City Assessor Danielson. Mr. Paskey was present to appeal the assessment on the property located at 6104 Bridge Road, Parcel No. 0710-204-3206-5, with a 2015 assessed value of land – \$51,600, and improvements – \$121,800, for a total of \$173,400. Mr. Paskey's objection form states an opinion of value of \$155,000.

City Clerk Andrusz distributed Mr. Paskey's exhibit materials which he then reviewed. Included was information from Accurate Appraisal, Zillow, the Wisconsin Property Assessment Manual, and an email from

Assessor Danielson regarding sales in his neighborhood. Mr. Paskey gave testimony, reading a history of the purchase of his home, which he purchased for lower than the asking price. The property was in foreclosure when he purchased it. Upgrades to the property were described, and he states has met the criteria for an arm's-length transaction as described in the Manual. His interactions with assessors at Open Book and by telephone and email were described. State statute language regarding sales data was read. Mr. Paskey stated his property's sale should be verified and it wasn't, causing Monona assessments to be unfair and not equitable.

City Assessor Danielson stated sales questionnaires are sent out for all property sales but only 24% are returned. Sales that are not arm's-length do not receive the questionnaire. Mr. Paskey's purchase was a foreclosure. Most foreclosures are not arm's-length. But some are arm's-length, so all should not be excluded. Mr. Paskey's purchase was for \$145,500, which was compared to 8 other similar properties. The lowest was \$170,000 and the highest was \$205,000. Mr. Paskey's does not fit current market transactions as it sold for well below the market standard. It is valued at \$108 per square foot and the average is \$112 per square foot. It was bank owned and the bank was trying to sell it, therefore it was a foreclosure.

City Assessor Danielson answered member's questions. Data verification can be done by physically viewing a property but it is not required to see the inside. Mr. Paskey's property was seen from the outside and the questionnaire was sent. Property values started to increase overall in 2014 and 2015. Members reviewed the exhibits. Mr. Paskey stated he based his value estimate on last year's assessment plus \$10,000 for window replacements and the roof, which didn't increase the property's value by the full cost of those improvements.

Mr. Hoelzel verified that there must be sufficiently credible evidence to overcome the presumption of correctness. Mr. Paskey stated he believes he has proven his was an arm's-length sale and a valid sale. Mr. Hoelzel stated that the market value of this property versus others that sold revealed only one that was lower. His property does not fit the market so therefore was sold under compulsion and was not an arm's-length transaction.

Deliberations began. Chairman Larsen stated Mr. Paskey used a reasonable approach in determining his value estimate using sales and improvements. Mr. Warner stated there is a clear-cut need to decide if this was an arm's-length transaction and he agrees with Mr. Hoelzel's stance that this was a foreclosure. This property is an outlier. Members agree this was a well-presented case but not compelling enough to overcome the presumption of correctness.

Following deliberations:

A motion by Mr. Hoelzel, seconded by Mr. Warner to sustain the 2015 assessment on 6104 Bridge Road, Parcel No. 0710-204-3206-5 as provided by the Assessor. On a roll call vote, all members voted in favor of the motion.

City Clerk Andrusz gave Mr. Paskey the Notice of Determination, referring to the explanation of next steps on the reverse.

Brad Schweiger and Shanda Wells appeared and were sworn in along with City Assessor Danielson. Mr. Schweiger and Ms. Wells were present to appeal the assessment on the property located at 5209 Mesa Road, Parcel No. 0710-184-6367-0, with a 2015 assessed value of land – \$47,100, and improvements – \$171,900, for a total of \$219,000. Mr. Schweiger and Ms. Wells' objection form states an opinion of value of \$207,900.

Ms. Wells gave testimony, distributing two copies of exhibits that members shared and reviewed. Ms. Shanda stated the property was purchased at the height of the market and acknowledges they most likely paid too much. They had been looking for 8 months and it was hard to find a house this size. There was somewhat of a bidding war for the home and it sold very quickly. They think the home has depreciated since their purchase and referenced pictures of patio, garage, driveway, basement, and kitchen wall cracking. At Open Book comparables

were larger and built with better materials, but were lower priced. Their home's price of \$179 per square foot is well above the average of \$129 per square foot. Mr. Schweiger testified that \$219,000 is not an accurate current market value of the house. At the time of purchase there wasn't much inventory available and they had to get out of their lease so were under some duress. They weren't the highest offer but had fewer contingencies. The property was listed at over \$230,000.

City Assessor Danielson testified the house was on the market for 48 hours and there was a bidding war. The buyers stated they were not knowledgeable and were under duress. He sees now that they did do research. The sales questionnaire was sent and the purchase fit the definition of arm's-length. Lots of buyers wanted the home. It is at the high end of square footage pricing. It was valued at \$195,500 in 2009 and sold for 10% higher. Sales and comparable properties were reviewed. The average square footage of five sales was \$152 per square foot. He stands behind the sales comparisons in determining the value and duress can go either way in pricing.

Mr. Warner asked whether the driveway and patio cracking were disclosed as defects. Ms. Wells and Mr. Schweiger stated no, but the damage wasn't that extensive until this last bad winter. They did hire an inspector and have a home warranty on the interior only.

Mr. Hoelzel stated the appraisal at the time of the sale was higher than they paid. Ms. Wells stated the damage occurred a year ago. Mr. Warner stated the value under consideration is as of January 1. Chairman Larsen stated values have begun to increase in the last 2 years.

Deliberations began. Ms. Chermak and Mr. Mastenbrook stated that based upon comparable square footage there should be a reduction.

A motion by Mr. Mastenbrook, seconded by Ms. Chermak to reduce the improvement value on 5209 Mesa Road to \$160,800, with the land value remaining at \$47,100 for a total assessment of \$207,900. On a roll call vote Ms. Chermak, Mr. Hoelzel, and Mr. Warner voted against the motion. The motion did not carry.

Mr. Warner stated this was an arm's-length transaction and the damage happened after the sale. If there was a fire on January 2, the value is still as of January 1, so the damage can't be considered in valuation. If the property is subsequently sold, that price can be considered.

Following deliberations:

A motion by Mr. Warner, seconded by Mr. Hoelzel to sustain the 2015 assessment on 5209 Mesa road, Parcel No. 0710-184-6367-0 as provided by the Assessor. On a roll call vote, Mr. Mastenbrook and Ms. Chermak voted against the motion. Chairman Larsen was required to vote to break the tie and voted in favor of the motion. The motion carried.

City Clerk Andrusz gave Mr. Schweiger and Ms. Wells the Notice of Determination, referring to the explanation of next steps on the reverse.

Jeannie Kowing appeared and was sworn in along with City Assessor Danielson. Ms. Kowing, who resides at 4158 Monona Drive, Madison, Wisconsin, 53716 was present to appeal the assessment on the property located at 501 West Dean Avenue, Parcel No. 0710-171-6147-2, with a 2015 assessed value of land - \$50,100, and improvements - \$131,100, for a total of \$181,200. Ms. Kowing's objection form states an opinion of value of \$135,000.

Ms. Kowing gave testimony that the property was bank-owned and on the market for 6 months beginning in May when she purchased it 5 days prior to January 1. The number of rooms has been reduced to 5. She removed the basement rooms because they were unlivable with moisture problems and rodents. Wiring and

plumbing has been redone, the roof repaired, and the garage roof replaced. She gutted the interior and the materials weren't salvageable. It was built in 1951 and sold for \$135,000. The house was not toured by an assessor. The improvements reported were done after January 1 and she will continue to work on the house and will rent it out or sell it. City Assessor Danielson asked whether everything had been ripped out of the interior. Ms. Kowing stated the basement, bathroom, kitchen, and dining room were gutted, along with all facing on every surface and asbestos removal.

City Assessor Danielson testified this was not an arm's-length transaction and sold for \$135,000. Assessors looked at the exterior of the house after permits were issued. The condition of the property justified the low selling price. Value is at \$72 per square foot; all other comparable transactions are higher. The sales price is a good reflection of market value at the time of purchase.

Following deliberations:

A motion by Mr. Mastenbrook, seconded by Ms. Chermak to reduce the improvement value on 501 West Dean Avenue to \$84,900, with the land value remaining at \$50,100 for a total assessment of \$135,000. On a roll call vote, all members voted in favor of the motion.

City Clerk Andrusz gave Ms. Kowing the Notice of Determination, referring to the explanation of next steps on the reverse.

While there were no more scheduled hearings, the Board remained in session until the 2 hour statutory requirement was met.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion by Ms. Chermak, seconded by Mr. Mastenbrook to adjourn, was carried. (8:00 p.m.)

Joan Andrusz
City Clerk

Complete this affidavit before the Board of Review (BOR) meets. Under state law (sec. 70.46(4), Wis. Stats.), you are required to file this form with the Wisconsin Department of Revenue (DOR). If you do not submit this form, your BOR may not be valid.

Instructions

1. Enter your 5-digit co-muni code or select the county, taxation district and municipality from the dropdown menus. You must be connected to the Internet while you enter this information.
2. Enter the board member's name(s) and dates of training
3. After you complete the form, review for accuracy and verify it is true, correct and complete
4. When you are ready to file, select "Submit"
5. Save/print document for your records

Watch for these symbols

When these appear in the form, use the mouse and hover over the symbol to view the message.

 Help is available for the field. Hover over the symbol for more information.

 There is a warning or caution for the field. Review what you entered.

 There is an error in the field. View the message and fix the error. You must fix all errors before you can submit the form.

Additional help

- BOR information – visit revenue.wi.gov/municipalities/boardofreview.html
- Questions/comments – contact us at (608) 266-7750 or bpador@revenue.wi.gov

Year		County	DANE
2016	Co-muni code	Taxation district	CITY
	13258	Municipality	MONONA

Clerk name	JOAN ANDRUSZ
Clerk email	JANDRUSZ@CI.MONONA.WI.US

	Board of Review Member	Training Date
	JAMES HOELZEL	05/09/2016
	ROBERT LARSEN	05/09/2016

To file

You must agree to the statement below, by selecting "Yes." This will serve as your lawful signature for this affidavit in any future transactions with the Wisconsin Department of Revenue (DOR). If you select "No," DOR will not accept your affidavit and it will not be filed.

Under penalties of law, I declare that this affidavit is true, correct and complete to the best of my knowledge and belief.

Do you agree with the statement above? Yes No

Confirmation

Your form was submitted successfully. The Training Affidavit is on next page. Save and or print for your records.

Confirmation no. **PA10720161325801462893998855**

Recording time **May 10 2016 10:26AM**



Board of Review Member Training Affidavit

This affidavit confirms that one or more Board of Review (BOR) voting members attended training before the BOR met, satisfying state law (sec. 70.46(4), Wis. Stats.).

STATE OF WISCONSIN

County of DANE

Co-muni code 13258

I, JOAN ANDRUSZ, the clerk for the CITY OF MONONA, swear the following BOR voting member(s), who represent(s) the municipality's chief executive officer or the officer's designee(s), attended a Wisconsin Department of Revenue approved BOR training program within two years of the BOR's first meeting. (sec. 70.46 (4), Wis. Stats.)

BOR member(s) and attendance date:

JAMES HOELZEL
Name

05/09/2016
Date

ROBERT LARSEN
Name

05/09/2016
Date

May 10 2016 10:26AM
Date electronically filed

JANDRUSZ@CI.MONONA.WI.US
Clerk email

City of Monona
Information Sheet-2016

<u>Assessments</u>		<u>TOTALS</u>
Residential	2015	\$718,085,988
	2016	\$757,385,600
	% Change	5.47%
Commercial	2015	\$355,234,600
	2016	\$367,426,100
	% Change	3.43%
Totals	2015	\$1,073,320,588
	2016	\$1,124,811,700
Overall Community Change	% Change	4.80%
<u>Equalized Value</u>		
Residential	2015	\$709,544,300
Est. Residential Equalized Value	2016	\$752,116,958
Est. Change	% Change	6.00%
Commercial	2015	\$349,983,300
Est. Commercial Equalized Value	2016	\$356,982,966
Est. Change	% Change	2.00%
Residential Assessment Ratio 2015		95.65%
Residential Assessment Ratio 2016 Est.		100.70%
Commercial Assessment Ratio 2015		103.78%
Commercial Assessment Ratio 2016 Est.		99.51%
Residential New Construction		\$3,000,000
Commercial New Construction		\$8,500,000