

## PUBLIC WORKS COMMITTEE

Minutes – January 6, 2016

The regular monthly meeting of the Public Works Committee for the City of Monona was called to order at 6:30pm by Alderperson Thomas.

Present: Alderperson Thomas, Alderman Speight, Mr. McConnell, Mr. Stolper, Ms. Busse, Mr. Franklin, Mr. Besch, Mr. Turino, Mr. Podell

Excused:

Also Present: DPW street operations supervisor Jeff Johnson

### APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Mr. Besch, and seconded by Mr. McConnell to approve the Public Works Committee minutes of October 14 2015, was carried.

APPEARANCES – None

### UNFINISHED BUSINESS

5A: Resident request for No Parking at 4501 Winnequah Rd. – This was a topic that was discussed at a previous meeting based on a request by a nearby resident. As stated by Director Stephany, the last discussion left off with committee members viewing the area to determine if No Parking was needed at this location. Mr. Besch, Mr. Podell, and Mr. Stolper viewed the area and feel that this area does not need to be signed No Parking. Ms. Busse sees this more of an issue for the safety of walkers in the area because of the obstructed views by the parked cars. Aside from that, Ms. Busse also agrees that this should not be signed as No Parking. The residents who live there would have nowhere else to park. Mr. Turino mentioned that the families he knows in the area are not happy with the current views at this intersection. Coming out of Outlook the views are obstructed. He would be in favor of looking into the request further. Mr. Turino noted that the cars that are parked there during the day are gone at night. The cars belong to employees who work at a local cleaning business.

Alderman Speight asked if there was an approved Ordinance that limited items in the right of way to a height of thirty six inches, to limit sight line obstruction. Director Stephany stated that City Ordinance does provide language on vision triangles. Public works staff can assist the situation by helping to keep right of way vegetation clear in the sight line area.

A motion was made by Mr. Turino, and seconded by Alderman Speight to table the discussion and have staff notify area residents that the committee is seeking their feedback on this No Parking request was carried.

### NEW BUSINESS

6A: Dredging request discussion – Director Stephany explained that he received a request from Mr. Barlow, to dredge Lake Monona shoreline near Frost Woods Beach Park going south towards the river. Mr. Barlow did not appear tonight to discuss his request. Alderperson Thomas stated the island is owned by the Frost Woods Neighborhood Association and they would have to pay their share if the shoreline is dredged. The committee discussed the current amount of sediment in the area and if there is any obligation for the City to dredge the shoreline. The committee will discuss this topic in the future if the request is brought forward again.

6B: Discussion and approval of the tandem axle cab and chassis with snow plow equipment proposal – Director Stephany presented the resolution, fiscal note and proposal summary to the committee. V&H Inc. Trucks provided the low cost proposal, Truck Country the second low proposal, and Lakeside International the high cost proposal. V&H did

not provide any explanation for deficiencies related to the truck specifications, which were written based off the Lakeside International specifications. Truck Country's proposal left out \$4,050 worth of items that were required in the RFP issued by the City. This is not reflected in the Proposal Summary submitted in the packet. Director Stephany and public works staff is recommending the purchase of the truck offered by Lakeside International. Five of the six snow plow trucks the City has are International models, the truck not an International is a Peterbilt. Jeff Johnson, the streets supervisor, was on hand to explain items in the proposals that did not meet specifications.

Mr. Franklin asked if the specs were built off the International model, making it so another company couldn't meet the specs. Director Stephany responded by stating proposers can meet the requirements if the deviations from the specification are explained. The \$4,050 worth of deviations was not included in the Truck Country price proposal. The RFP allows for equal models or minor deviations. Each manufacturer has their own engine model, but deviations from the specification need to be explained. Mr. Franklin thought a better way to get a comparable price would be to send the RFP to three different International representatives.

Mr. Stolper stated what caught his eye was that Lakeside International met every spec written in the RFP, and believes it would be a waste of time for another company to submit a proposal. If the tax payer money is to be spent on equipment, there needs to be some degree of competition. A spec needs to be built that various people can meet, which would then provide a reasonable set of proposals. Then everyone has a fighting chance at the proposals. Mr. Stolper believes the process put in place to receive proposals doesn't come close to being competitive, and it is a single source contract.

Mr. Stolper also added that he found it curious that Lakeside International provided an analysis of the V&H Truck proposal, and asked if it was standard procedure that this be done. Director Stephany stated that it is normal for a competitor to ask to see another's response, and that the comparison was not asked for. The Lakeside International rep asked to see their competitor's proposal and then provided an explanation of the differences.

Mr. Stolper questioned the fact that Burke Truck Equipment was the preferred equipment provider and listed in the RFP. Director Stephany stated that the crew preferred the Burke package because the last truck that was purchased had the Monroe Truck Equipment package and it failed on the very first operation. It failed many times and eventually all items that were not working were completely replaced, and staff did not want to go through that issue again. The majority of the Monroe Truck issues were covered under warranty. Mr. Stolper again stated that this was a single source RFP.

Alderman Speight added that the process does allow for apples to apples comparison. Alderperson Thomas stated that we do have a bias to the International model because we have five trucks now. Mr. Johnson confirmed that staff does prefer the International and Burke package, and added that any driver can get in a truck and all the controls are the same, which makes it easier to operate. The same goes for the mechanic in that it is easier to maintain one type of truck versus many different types of trucks. There is no bias against any one type of truck, but just that it is preferred that all the plow trucks be the same.

Mr. Besch stated that so many analogies could be looked at. A contractor should be able to give you what you want according to specs. Specs provide items that we want. He considers the proposal received a no brainer. It's a proposal and not a bid.

Mr. McConnell stated that it is not reasonable for the City to draw up its own specs because it requires a tremendous amount of work, a lot of skill and time. Things change all the time for staff to draw up specs.

Ms. Busse stated that the process shows what we want and provides a way for a competitor to show you that this is what they have, and that they think their spec could be just as good.

Alderperson Thomas suggested in the future, a process could be created where a sub-committee could be formed to review vehicle purchases. What staff has done with this RFP is appropriate and legitimate, and has followed past

practices. Alderperson Thomas stated further that she is pleased with what the staff does, and has faith in what staff wants which would allow them to do the best job for the city.

In the future, non-consequential items should not be listed in the spec, such as where the coat hook is hung, or what the decibel of the back-up alarm should be.

A motion was made by Mr. Turino, and seconded by Ms. Busse to approve the Lakeside International proposal as submitted was carried. Voting nay were Mr. Stolper and Mr. Podell.

6C: Discussion and approval of a one ton dump truck cab and chassis proposal – Director Stephany explained the resolution, fiscal note and State contract documents for cooperative purchasing. The proposal presented is to purchase the cab and chassis from Ewald Automotive through the State of Wisconsin cooperative purchasing program. The public works department and police department has purchased many vehicles in the past as offered through the State contract. This purchase would be a joint purchase with the parks department.

Mr. Stolper stated we are getting a discount, but questioned when the last time anyone paid MSRP pricing. The City will be receiving an \$11,538 discount.

The City is upsizing the truck from a 2500 level pickup to the one ton dump based on need. Both the parks department and public works department are often competing for the single one ton dump that we have. We would be buying a truck that comes with gasoline instead of diesel due to cheaper pricing.

Mr. Stolper questioned why we are purchasing from Ewald Automotive and not Kayser Automotive, to which Director Stephany responded that it is the preference of the City based on past purchasing from Ewald Automotive. The police department and public works department have purchased many vehicles successfully from Ewald Automotive. If needed, warranty work can be done locally.

A motion was made by Ms. Busse, and seconded by Mr. Turino to approve the purchase of the one ton dump truck cab and chassis from Ewald Automotive was carried.

6D: 2016 Projects Update – Director Stephany provided a verbal update on various projects in 2016. Information sheets were passed out to the committee on the Adaptive Management Program and the Bridge Road Pedestrian Plan, as completed by Strand Associates. The 2016 projects will be discussed at various meetings in the near future.

NEXT SCHEDULED MEETING: Wednesday, February 3, 2016.

#### ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Ms. Busse and seconded by Mr. Franklin to adjourn was carried (8:19 pm).

Daniel Stephany  
Director of Public Works